



ISRAEL NATIONAL DEFENSE COLLEGE (INDC)

48th CLASS, 2020 - 2021

RESEARCH PROPOSAL

ARMED FORCES ROLE IN MANAGEMENT OF
CIVILIAN EMERGENCIES & DISASTERS
IN A POST COVID 19 WORLD

Submitted by : Olga Polyakov, Mohit Trivedi and Cristian Bauer.

Academic advisor: Professor Kobi Peleg.

Academic accompanying instructor: Ambassador Alona Fischer.

DATED : 05 JANUARY 2021

(Total 11 Pages)

RESEARCH PROPOSAL

ARMED FORCES ROLE IN MANAGEMENT OF CIVILIAN EMERGENCIES AND DISASTERS IN A POST COVID 19 WORLD

*“We cannot stop natural disasters, but we can arm ourselves with knowledge:
so many lives wouldn't have to be lost if there was enough disaster preparedness.”*

- Petra Nemcova

INTRODUCTION

The **armed forces the world over** have **done a commendable job**, when called **to aid civil authorities**, especially, in the **wake of natural calamities or man-made disasters**. The **ongoing COVID-19 pandemic** has **tested healthcare and associated infrastructure** of nations **like nothing else before**. There are **precedents, e.g. the Spanish Flu, but none on the scale of COVID-19**. The coronavirus crisis threatens to undermine fundamental concepts and worldviews in a range of fields. **Uncertainty and confusion dominate the public discourse** in most countries combating the spread of the virus. The COVID-19 pandemic **requires all stakeholders** - individuals, communities, and state organs - **to mobilize** in order to **contain the pandemic and minimize its severe short- and long-term consequences**. Indeed the **crisis is nothing short of war**, though with very **different dimensions and implications** which are yet to manifest. Understanding the way this **war is likely to pan out is difficult to predict**. It is **simply too early to say how this will impact the nation and international environment over the next few years**. For most, it will be **on-the-job learning**. Under such an **uncertain environment**, the **Armed Forces role** is a **good example to study the response management for the future**.

“I always tried to turn every disaster into an opportunity.”

- John D. Rockefeller

THE PROJECT GOALS

Aim of the Research

The research paper aims to **analyze how the response to civilian emergencies and disasters in future can be improved by examining the planning and legal dimension of armed forces employment using COVID-19 as a case study.**

Goals of the Research

The research paper endeavors to examine **militaries planning process and legal provisions** for their **employment toward response to civilian emergencies using COVID-19 as a case study.** Towards this the **response** by the **armies of Germany, India and Israel** will be **studied.** The **goal** will be **to analyze how this aspect** can be **used to suggest a future response mechanisms** to deal with civilian emergencies and disasters in post COVID-19 world.

The research paper will then seek to present **recommendations and probable solutions** with respect to **the challenges posed by employing armies, in particular IDF during civilian emergencies without compromising on the operational preparedness.**

In addition, the paper will finally attempt to **suggest structures, conceptual framework and capability required to address such civilian emergencies in future by incorporating the best practices derived.** The aspect emphasized will be to **what extent armed forces maybe employed or how they can influence civilian response mechanism** in future.

THE IMPORTANCE OF THE SUBJECT TO NATIONAL SECURITY

The **frequency, scope and intensity of natural disasters** are **increasing,** and so too are the **number of victims, related deaths and the amount of economic damage.** The **increasing frequency of disasters** often **overwhelms civilian management structures** and **demands the engagement of the military.** COVID-19 has demonstrated how it has **endangered** not only the **physical wellness of citizens but also**

the socio-economic structures. Climate change is considered critical force shaping 21st century. When global temperatures rise, essential resources will dwindle in many poor and divided countries, thus provoking conflict among internal factions and threatening the survival of fragile governments which would result in fueling further tensions to already strained international relations. In this chaotic environment, terrorist groups and organized crime groups will flourish, while dispossessed farmers will migrate in search of jobs - typically encountering hostility wherever they go. All this instability will result in deadly pandemics, incessant warfare, and a relentless call on the armed forces to not only provide humanitarian relief and troop support but also in some countries to stabilize the situation.

The aspect of **non-traditional security threats as described above assume greater relevance in a post COVID-19 world. Nations need to be prepared and alive to this challenge and start preparing now to provide an effective response to all types of emergencies and major crises at national, regional and local level. This entails dovetailing all aspects of national power including military and other civilian and government resources / organs. Particularly relevant would be to see how the inherent planning capacity and capability of armed forces coupled with legalities of their employment can be better suited to evolve a response mechanism in such situations without compromising on the core military objectives. Thereby ensuring National Security is not adversely impacted.**

THE RESEARCH QUESTION AND SECONDARY INQUIRIES

Research Question

How planning and legal aspects render armed forces a better option in combatting civilian emergencies and disasters by taking response of armed forces from Germany, India and Israel for COVID-19 as a case study.

Secondary Inquiries

The paper will endeavor to examine and analyze the following secondary inquiries :

- (a) How much is the **threat to National Security** by not being **adequately prepared** for **natural or man-made calamity like earthquakes, pandemics, etc?**
- (b) Why are **armed forces prioritized for response** in such crisis? Is it **correct to employ armed forces** for such tasks or is it **best not to involve them at all?** To **what extent and how should the armed forces be employed** for such tasks?
- (c) How are the **legal and policy regulations** impacting the **Armed Forces employment** while **responding to civilian emergencies?**
- (d) Is the present **framework and response architecture** involving the **armed forces** in the **management of COVID-19** **adequate** to address the **pandemics of the future?** What **lessons** can be drawn from the present **COVID-19 response model of armies of Israel, India and Germany** towards **force capability and capacity** particularly to deal simultaneously with the appreciated **security threat from inner and outer circle** of influence in future? How can it be **maximized without adversely impacting National Security?**
- (e) What are the **best practices after the study of response by armies of Israel, India and Germany for COVID-19** that can be emulated for **speedy and timely response mechanism for the future?**
- (f) What are the **measures recommended to be adopted** specifically for **IDF response mechanism** towards **civilian emergencies** - internal and external, so as to **augment Israel's overall national security** in the **changing milieu?**

THE RESEARCH METHOD

The research will use the information available from **open source on the internet** and also the **Haifa University research platform**. The services of relevant books from the **Library at MABAL and Haifa University** will be utilized in doing the literature survey.

Interview with experts from India, Germany and Israel is also being planned in order to seek inputs with respect to response mechanism, structures, shortcomings, proposal for augmenting the responses, etc for employment of armed forces in civilian emergencies. In addition, it is also proposed to do a **Delphi Questionnaire for seeking inputs from stakeholders** with respect to validating the research question.

THE PROJECT STRUCTURE

This paper will look at the **present system of response of armies of India, Israel and Germany** in **dealing with the ongoing crisis of COVID-19** and **identify the best practices followed** by them in combating civilian emergencies. It will then examine **how planning process** inherent to militaries and **legal aspects** of their employment in responding to civil emergencies **render them better suited** to deal with such crisis. Additionally it will also analyze to **what extent and how should they be employed** to combat civil emergencies and disasters in future. Finally, suggest a **framework for IDF**. The **paper is proposed** to be **covered** as under:

(a) **Chapter 1 - Introduction**. This is the **introductory chapter**. It will lay out the **statement of problem and hypothesis** for the research as also the **rationale for undertaking the study**. It will further explain the **aims and objectives** of the **research** and give out the **scheme of Chapters** and the **expected outcomes** as also certain references that form part of the study.

(b) **Chapter 2 - Armed Forces Response to Civilian Emergencies**. This chapter will entail giving a **broad perspective** of the **response mechanism of India, Israel and Germany** for dealing with **civilian emergencies and disasters** under the following broad head:

(i) **Role of Armed forces** in rendering assistance to civil authority during **natural calamities like floods, earthquake and tsunami, evacuation of civilians, rocket attacks, etc.**

- (ii) **Legal and regulatory framework** for requisitioning armed forces for civilian emergencies. **Government stance** on employment of armed forces
 - (iii) **Organization** for response and **methodology for employment**.
 - (iv) **Use of force multipliers** (equipment and technology), and **interface with other agencies**
 - (v) **Humanitarian missions** undertaken by **the armies in recent times**.
- (c) **Chapter 3 - Case Study on Covid-19 Management - An Analogy**. The present role of IDF, Indian and German Armed Forces in COVID- 19 Management will be **examined** in this chapter. The **analysis of the manner in which the three armed forces were employed** will enable a **conceptual framework, methodology and employment philosophy** to be **formulated** for **engaging armed forces in pandemic management in particular and civilian emergencies in general**.
- (d) **Chapter 4 - Best Practices : An Assessment** . This chapter will deal with a **summation of best practices observed** in the response of **civilian emergencies** by **Armed Forces** of Israel, India and Germany. This will be arrived after **reviewing the broad construct of their response mechanism** with particular reference to the **planning and legal aspects** and the **degree of their employment**.
- (e) **Chapter 5- Analysis**. Discussion on the findings to attain **answers to the following** will be given in this chapter:
- (i) Are the **planning process and legal provisions** for militaries employment **rendering them better suited** for a response during the crisis?
 - (ii) To **what extent and how** should the **militaries be involved** in the response mechanism?
 - (iii) What should be the **conceptual framework** for a **response mechanism** that not only **achieves economy of effort** but also **optimally utilizes the resource available** in future?

- (iv) What **measures need to be instituted** to **ensure optimal resource utilization** during such crisis to **ensure economy of effort**?
- (v) What are the **capacity and capability enhancement measures required** for the future response mechanism?
- (f) **Chapter 6 - Recommendations and Way Forward for IDF.** The main **aspects proposed** to be covered in this chapter are:
 - (i) **Proposed organizational structure** for Israel, in particular **IDF to deal with such situations, highlighting the changes** required.
 - (ii) **Legal provisions and legislation** required.
 - (iii) **Capacity and Capability enhancement required** in Israel to meet the challenge posed including **command and control architecture**.
 - (iv) Endeavour to suggest an **overall response model framework for Israel** for dealing with such crisis in the future.
- (g) **Summary / Conclusion.** **Review of research question** and the **goals** of the research paper.
- (h) **Bibliography.**

THE PROJECT LIMITS

The research will **primarily focus** on the **conceptual construct of a framework** for an **effective response mechanism** based on the **planning and legal aspects** of employing armed forces in civilian emergencies. It does **not comment** on the **logistical or budgetary capabilities** of the model proposed. Moreover, since the research is only **focusing primarily on the COVID-19 response**, the **legitimacy issue** of armed forces employment in such crisis is being examined accordingly. Lastly, the aspect of **Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) and other such informal institutions** during such crisis is **not in the research scope**.

TERMINOLOGY

It will be prudent to **peep into the future** and **visualize how the role played by armed forces in civilian emergencies management will evolve**. There are growing concerns the world over about **global warming and climate change**, with **resultant ill effects and conditions leading to triggering of disasters**. **Armed forces** across the world need to be **alive to the deleterious effects of global warming** and should **devise a thorough analysis of its strategic implications**. **Militaries** across the world generally continue to **stand ready to support civil authorities** when their **capacity is overwhelmed**. Armed forces provide this **support from the spare capacity**, so it is subject to the **availability of resources, without affecting core military objectives**. But when **called frequently, their core military objectives may get impacted**. This in turn will have an **impact** on the **overall National Security**. Therefore, it is imperative that a **suitable response mechanism** be **evolved** keeping in mind the **expertise of the armed forces** particularly the aspects of **planning for uncertainties and unpredictability inherent in armed forces along with legal dimension**. Further, the **extent of involvement of armed forces during such crisis** will also need to be **outlined to ensure that the operational readiness** to deal with **their core objective** is **maintained** at all times.

LIST OF SOURCES (PARTIAL)

1. Armed Forces in Aid to Civilian Authorities in COVID-19 environment by Jaideep Chanda, Published on Vivekananda International Foundation (<https://www.vifindia.org>)
2. Bartal, D. (2013), Intractable Conflicts: socio-psychological foundations and dynamics, Cambridge University Press.
3. Climate Emergency - Military Aid to Civil Power (<https://www.defenceiq.com/air-land-and-sea-defence-services/articles/climate-emergency-military-aid-to-civil-power>)

4. Dains, R.N. (2004), Lasswell's Garrison, State Reconsidered: exploring a paradigm shift in U.S. civil-military relations research, PhD Dissertation, The University of Alabama <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/311d/f4f9b5af95cab4fd6a910b5bbf7ac7f9e4c0.pdf>
5. Dunlap, C., 19.3.2020, Why militarizing the corona virus response is a bad idea -for now any way, Lawfare.
(<https://sites.duke.edu/lawfire/2020/03/19/why-militarizing-the-coronavirus-response-is-a-bad-idea-for-now-anyway>)
6. Eran-Jona, M. (2015), Israelis' Perception of the IDF: A Split Between it as an Armed Force and as a Public Institution, GIIS, UMD
(<https://cpb-us-e1.wpmucdn.com/blog.umd.edu/dist/b/504/files/2017/08/Meytal-Eran-Jona-paper-2-12cvl4q.pdf>)
7. Israel, The Ministry of Defense (2011), The civil front – the management of the civil front in time of crisis: Dr. Pinhas Yehezkeili.
8. Meir Elran, Amichai Cohen, Carmit Padan, Idit Shafran Gittleman, Limiting IDF Engagement in Civilian Crises, Special Publication, in conjunction with The Israel Democracy Institute, May 8, 2020.
9. Meir Elran, Amichai Cohen, Carmit Padan, Idit Shafran Gitelman, The relations between society and militaries in Israel in the Shadow of the Corona: Insights from the First Wave, Special Release, September 21, 2020.
10. Meir Elran, Management of the Civilian Front by the Home Front Command: Significance and Implications, INSS Insight No. 1066, June 13, 2018.
11. Natural Disaster Management in India by Vinod K Sharma & D Kaushik Ashutosh.
12. Patrick Cox, "Fires, Orchestra, Parachutes, Some Other Ways to Describe Coronavirus – Besides War", The World, 28.4.2020, <https://www.pri.org/stories/2020-04-28/fires-orchestras-parachutes-some-other-ways-describe-coronavirus-besides-war>
13. Peri, Y. (1985), Between Battles and Ballots: Israeli Military in Politics, Cambridge

University. Press, p. 24

14. Role Of Armed Forces During Disaster Relief

(<https://www.ukessays.com/essays/tourism/role-of-armed-forces-during-disaster-relief-tourism-essay.php>)

15. Shivananda H and PK Gautam, Reasserting India's Disaster Preparedness and Role of India Armed Forces.

16. The National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA)

(<https://www.ndma.gov.in/>)

17. The Role of the Military in International Disaster Relief Activities by Mark Phillips

http://www.nids.mod.go.jp/english/event/symposium/pdf/2011/e_03.pdf

18. Yasmeeen Serhan, "The Case Against Waging 'War' on the Coronavirus", The Atlantic, 31.3.2020.

<https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2020/03/war-metaphor-coronavirus/609049>

19. חוק ההתגוננות האזרחית, התשי"א-1951,

<https://main.knesset.gov.il/Activity/Legislation/Laws/Pages/LawPrimary.aspx?t=laws&st=lawlaws&lawitemid=2000278>

20. צוות הבחינה בראשות האלוף (מילי) הרצל שפיר ובהשתתפות יורם לוינסקי, ב' רז, אבי ילינק, איתן

שמשוני, " בירמן, רן מיכאלי, מ' רווח, ניסים מלכה, רון גביש, ברוך אברהמי, דב קהת, דן נעמן, " שניר, ארגון ותפעול מערך העורף במדינת ישראל, צה"ל, אגף התכנון, 1992 ("צוות שפיר").

21. הרצל שפיר, יורם לוינסקי אבי בכר מיכאל נבון, העברת תחום העורף לאחריות המשרד לביטחון

הפנים, אבן דרך א', שפאור בע"מ, 27 ביולי 2000.

22. דו"ח ראשוני – הוועדה לבחינת מוכנות העורף במצבי חירום, ירושלים, הכנסת, ועדת החוץ

והביטחון, אלול התשס"ו-ספטמבר 2006 ("ועדת אילון").

23. יעקוב עמידרור, העברת האחריות על ביטחון הפנים למשרד לביטחון הפנים, ראיון ב-19 בינואר

בינואר 2005 (בכתובים בידי המחבר).

24. כהן, ע. שפרן-גיטלמן, ע. (2020), **מעורבות צה"ל במשבר הקורונה, סקירה משפטית והמלצות, המכון הישראלי לדמוקרטיה**, <https://www.idi.org.il/books/31433>.
25. "תנו לצה"ל לעזור, לא לנהל", מאמר מערכת, הארץ, 14.4.2020
<https://mail.google.com/mail/u/0/#search/meiryelran%40gmail.com?projector=1>
26. לוי, י. (2020), **מי שולט על הצבא? בין פיקוח על הצבא לשליטה בצבאיות**, ירושלים, הוצאת מאגנס; אורי בן אליעזר (2019), **מלחמה במקום שלום - מאה שנות לאומיות ומיליטריזם בישראל**, הוצאת מודן.
27. אביתר מתניה, **"אסור לתת למערכת הביטחון לנהל את המשבר"**, ישראלהיום, 12.04.2020.
<https://www.israelhayom.co.il/opinion/750737>
28. עמוס ידליון, **"זמן לתחקר את ניהול המשבר"**, 19.04.2020 מאמר דעה
[Ynet, https://www.ynet.co.il/articles/0,7340,L-5717124,00.html](https://www.ynet.co.il/articles/0,7340,L-5717124,00.html)
29. אלוף (מיל') גיורא איילנד, **"אין עוד מלבדו?"**, ראיון ב-דה מרקר ב-26.03.2020
<https://www.themarker.com/markerweek/.premium-1.8712876>
30. פלד, ט. (אפריל 2012) **"עם בונה צבא בונה עם - האמנם?"**, מערכות, 442, עמ' 68-73.